REJECTION OF THE POLICY FOR THE RELOCATION OF STREET VENDORS (PKL) IN PADANG PANJANG CITY CENTER MARKET

1Defita Ayunda  
2Syafirizal  
3Resdati*

1,2,3Universitas Riau, Indonesia  
*Corresponding Email Author: resdati@lecturer.unri.ac.id

Keywords  
Rejections; Policy; Relocation; Street Vendor.

Abstract  
This study aims to determine the factors causing the rejection and the form of rejection of the street vendor relocation policy at the Padang Panjang City Central Market. The method used to obtain research results is a descriptive qualitative method. Data collection techniques in this study used in-depth interviews, observation, and documentation. Informants in this study amounted to 9 people with 1 key informant Head of Market Management and 8 street vendors in Pasar Baru Ring Road selected using a purposive sampling technique. The theory used in this study is Ralf Dahrendorf’s conflict theory which suggests that there are two groups of interests in conflict, including groups that have authority and groups that must submit to authority. The results of this study indicate that there are two factors causing the refusal of the relocation policy, internal factors and external factors. The internal factors causing the rejection of the relocation policy, are the location of the business that has been occupied for a long time, higher income levels, and lower rents. External factors causing the rejection of the relocation policy, namely the arrangement of trading places that have not been well organized, and inconsistent law enforcement officials in relocating street vendors. The form of rejection of the street vendor relocation policy is in the form of continuing to sell in places that have been banned and protesting.

How to cite this article:  

Submit date : December 5, 2022  
Review date : February 4, 2023  
Accepted : October 14, 2023  
Published : October 15, 2023
INTRODUCTION

The market is a place where economic activities take place that connect sellers and buyers in order to carry out the trade transaction process to fulfill their needs. Economics is the central point of all social sciences and is the oldest science from literature and the newest science (Aminuyati & Mashudi, 2021). The market as a trading center is inhabited by various groups of traders with different types of merchandise. Meanwhile, traders whose existence is a social problem now, namely Kali Lima Traders (PKL). The definition of street vendors itself is a business actor who runs an unofficial business that spreads across the city and inhabits a changing business location, and is scattered in public spaces. Changes in the level of socio-economic status of the surrounding population are something that is currently being felt (Hayat, 2021).

The majority of street vendors in Indonesia are micro businesses. (Muliati et al., 2022). Based on data obtained from the 2016 Economic Census by the Central Bureau of Statistics from a total of 26.7 million businesses, 7.8 million of these businesses occupy special business buildings, but a total of 18.9 million businesses do not occupy specific business buildings, such as itinerant traders, home-based businesses, street vendors and others. According to (Ramadhan, Iwan., Dewantara et al., 2020) there are three indicators of changes in a community's economy, firstly the community's income, availability of employment opportunities, and land prices.

The existence of street vendors is the impact of the disproportionate number of job seekers with the jobs provided. Various qualifications are set by the formal sector in finding workers, causing not all job seekers to be able to compete in getting these jobs. Many people do not have higher education and do not have the skills needed, which results in them having to create their own job opportunities through the informal sector. The reason they choose the informal sector by becoming street vendors is because the capital required is small, and can provide a living for the family,(Sawitri et al., 2021). The rise of the existence of street vendors has created inconvenience to the people in the surrounding environment. They tend to be rampant in placing their merchandise. In fact, they place their stalls along the road which causes congestion, and makes it difficult for people on foot to access. Not only that, these street vendors also do not pay attention to the cleanliness of the surrounding environment by ignoring the garbage that is scattered and can cause foul odors and diseases for people who are around. Street vendors, or frequent ones so-called street vendors are community traders, who mostly sell by utilizing roadside areas kingdom (Astuti et al., 2017).

Second, working time is uncertain, especially from morning to evening with different merchandise. Third, the variety of merchandise varies, there are snacks (processed food), plants or ornamental fish, clothes, shoes, bags, handicrafts, various types of fruit, and other merchandise. Fourth, the place of business is closed, open, using umbrellas, mats, carts, pikulan, tables, semi-permanent building structures and no construction. Fifth, most street vendors disturb the environment, traffic lanes, order, and cleanliness.

The existence of street vendors can be found in Padang Panjang City in West Sumatra Province with an area of 2,300 hectares or about 0.05 percent of the total area of West Sumatra. The emergence of street vendors began with a fire that occurred in Padang Panjang Market in 2011, within one month there were three fires with a total of 318 stalls of
traders burned down. After the fires occurred and seeing the condition of the Padang Panjang Market building which was no longer habitable. So, the Padang Panjang City government issued a policy to carry out market development. In 2015, the first step in rejuvenating the central market began by building a shelter market along Jalan Imam Bonjol, Jalan Lingkar Pasar Baru to Jalan M. Syafei, to move traders who sell in the Padang Panjang City Central Market. The construction of the Padang Panjang City Center Market, took place from 2016 to 2018. Development basically cannot be separated from the process of change that covers the entire social system such as politics and economics (Mulya et al., 2022). During the construction of the market, street vendors can be found on several streets, such as Jalan Abduk Muis, Jalan Imam Bonjol and Jalan Lingkar Pasar Baru. However, the most common presence of street vendors is in the area of Jalan Lingkar Pasar Baru. Even though there are residential areas in the Jalan Lingkar Pasar Baru area. The government provides Jalan Lingkar Pasar Baru to be used as a means of transportation for the surrounding community, but by PKL, the road is used as a place to sell, not a few people on the New Market Ring Road are uncomfortable and do not agree with the presence of PKL. In addition, the presence of street vendors around the New Market Ring Road also affects the order, cleanliness, beauty and comfort of Padang Panjang City.

Table 1. Number of street vendors who do not sell in their place

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Type Of Commodity</th>
<th>Number Of Street Vendors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Chilies/ spices</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Vegetables/ young stuff</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Food</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Cookies/ crackers</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Apparel</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Dried fish</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Broilers</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>P&amp;D</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>Coconut cream</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Amount</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>43</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Data processed by researchers, 2022

According to Padang Panjang Mayor Decree Number 169 of 2019 on the amendment of Padang Panjang Mayor Decree Number 138 of 2018, the rental prices for stalls and loses at the Padang Panjang City Central Market are as follows:

Table 2. Kiosk and Los Rental Prices in the Central Market of Padang Panjang City

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cluster</th>
<th>Kiosk Rental Amount</th>
<th>Los Rent Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>Rp. 90.000/ meter /</td>
<td>Rp. 40.000/ meter/ month</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Rejection of The Policy for The Relocation of Street Vendors (PKL) In Padang Panjang City Center Market

DOI: 10.26418/j-psh.v14i2.6112

Defita Ayunda, Syafirizal, Resdati | 240

The basis for the consideration of determining the rental price is Law Number 28 of 2009 concerning Regional Taxes and Levies which states that the amount of rent should take into account the surrounding rental price, as well as Minister of Home Affairs Regulation Number 19 of 2016 concerning the Management of Regional Property which explains, that: "The calculation of the tariff or rental budget for market stalls and loses also considers the economic value, namely the purchasing power of the community or the ability and willingness to pay of the community. Another factor that is the reason why street vendors are not willing to be relocated is the implementation of policies that are not in accordance with the provisions. Based on Perwako No. 2/2018 regarding the Management System and Procedures of the Padang Panjang City Central Market, the types of commodities that are allowed to be sold in stalls and los in the Padang Panjang City Central Market are as follows.

Table 3. Types of Commodities in the Central Market of Padang Panjang City

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Block</th>
<th>Number of Stalls/ Los</th>
<th>Type Of Commodity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1.  | Block A LT 1 (stalls) | 71 | a. Chilies/spices  
   b. Iron/workman's tools  
   c. Books/stationery  
   d. Pharmacy/medicine house  
   e. Mattress, carpet |
|     | Block A LT 1 (los) | 126 | a. Chili/Spice  
   b. Vegetables/Mudo Goods  
   c. Food/Drinks  
   d. Cakes/Crackers |
| 2.  | Block A LT 2 (stalls) | 182 | a. Apparel  
   b. Sandals  
   c. Bags and Flowers |
| 3.  | Block A LT 3 (stalls) | 99 | a. Office  
   b. Basic fabric/textile  
   c. Glassware  
   d. Watches, sports equipment |
| 4.  | Block B LT 1 (los) | 144 | a. Meat  
   b. Dried Fish  
   c. Vegetables/Mudo Goods  
   d. Coconut/Coconut Milk |
Rejection of The Policy for The Relocation of Street Vendors (PKL) In Padang Panjang City Center Market
DOI: 10.26418/j-psh.v14i2.6112

Based on the table above, it is understood that the transfer of traders in the Padang Panjang City Central Market has been determined based on the category of commodity types sold, with the aim that market management and empowerment can be neatly organized. This is based on the Padang Panjang Mayor Regulation Number 36 of 2018 which is listed in chapter II regarding the requirements and procedures for the placement of traders contained in article 4 which reads:

1. The placement of traders in the Central Market is carried out through a zoning system of merchandise commodity type categories.
2. The zoning system listed in paragraph (1) is carried out in accordance with the location and conditions of the Central Market.
3. The placement of traders based on the zoning system as contained in paragraph (1) shall be decided by the Mayor.

Observations found that the transfer of traders did not match the location that had been determined, namely based on the type of commodity sold, it was found that there were traders on the second floor of Block A who sold food and drinks. As a result, many kiosks and stalls in Block C on the third floor are unoccupied. Traders only want to fill the lowest floor, so the third floor is empty of buyers because buyers prefer to buy traders who sell on the first floor. This condition is influenced by the change in the shape of the old market building which is still traditional with the shape of the new Padang Panjang City Center Market building which is multi-storey and only provides stairs for shoppers to access shopping to the upper level.

The impact of the difference in the building is felt by buyers to make it difficult for them to shop at traders who sell on the upper floors, therefore buyers prefer to buy traders who sell on the first floor on the grounds that it is closer and does not require energy to climb the stairs to the third floor. The first floor of the building, which is considered strategic,
causes conflicts between fellow traders who are fighting over getting a kiosk or los on the first floor. However, not all traders get the selling place they want. Thus, many traders choose to become street vendors by opening stalls near the market yard on Jalan Lingkar Pasar Baru.

Ralf Dahrendrof's approach assumes that all social systems are imperatively coordinated with authority relations. Dahrendrof emphasizes institutionalized authority structures rather than just power-based supremacy. Dahrendrof recognizes the importance of power imbalances (Maktumah et al., 2023). The ability to impose one's will despite resistance from authority, i.e. the legitimate right to expect compliance.

Ralf Dahrendrof's conflict approach, emphasizes the conflict of interests in the relationship between conflicting parties between those who legitimately exercise authority and those who are under authority. Among the interests of the ruling class is maintaining the legitimacy of its dominant position or maintaining the status quo (Sujoko, 2022). At the same time, the interests of the underclass challenge the legitimacy of existing authority. A latent interest is an objective class interest that is established by structural means and without being understood by an individual (Kurniawan & Tamam, 2023). In contrast, class interests that are realized by an individual as goals are called manifest interests.

Dahrendrof distinguishes three main types of groups. First, a pseudo-group or a group of people who share a common role interest. Second, interest groups are parties in conflict with a system, form of organization, program or goal and members. Third, conflict groups are groups that participate in conflicts and groups that have interests.

Ralf Dahrendrof's Conflict Theory also explains the relationship between conflict and change. Conflict is only part of social reality, in the sense that conflict changes and develops (Hanafi, 2018). When a conflict group emerges, the group plays a role in activities that cause changes to the social structure. If conflict escalates, it will result in more radical change. Furthermore, when strong conflict leads to violence, it will cause sudden structural changes. Therefore, conflict is always associated with change or the status quo.

The rejection of the relocation policy of street vendors in the Central Market of Padang Panjang City, due to differences in interests and authority desired by the actors participating in the conflict, namely between street vendors and the government. The interests possessed by street vendors cause them to want to maintain the location where they sell now, while on the other hand the government also has an interest in carrying out economic development through increasing market utilization by disciplining street vendors to trade in the market. The authority possessed by the government means that the government has the power to implement the policy to relocate street vendors on the New Market Ring Road to the provided Padang Panjang City Center Market. However, PKL as a group that does not have authority tries to oppose the government’s policy, so a conflict arises between the government and PKL which has an impact on the rejection of the PKL relocation policy in the Padang Panjang City Central Market.

METHODS

The research conducted uses a qualitative method with descriptive analysis that can provide an overview of the rejection of the PKL relocation policy in the Central Market of Padang Panjang City. Qualitative research is research that describes content, but is not
based on statistical accuracy. The use of words arranged into the structure of an essay or event, has a clearer, more vivid view, a lot of meaning, and can be more convincing to readers, other researchers, policy makers, practitioners than pages full of numbers. The location of this research is to the south of the Padang Panjang City Central Market, namely on Jalan Lingkar Pasar Baru, at this location there are many street vendors who sell out of place, and the PKI selling places are located in residential areas and disturb public facilities provided by the government.

The subjects in this study are street vendors around Jalan Lingkar Pasar Baru, totaling 8 people and 1 head of the Padang Panjang City Cooperative Small and Medium Enterprises Trade Office. In this study the research subject will be determined, through purposive sampling technique by determining certain criteria. The data collection techniques used in this research are observation, in-depth interviews and documentation.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The first crackdown conducted by the market management and Satpol PP can be said to be successful, because all traders moved to sell inside the Padang Panjang City Central Market. However, this condition did not last long one year after the large-scale curbing carried out by the market management and Satpol PP, traders who had difficulty selling in the Padang Panjang City Central Market again moved to sell in the old shelter market, namely on Jalan Lingkar Pasar Baru. To overcome this problem, the market manager in collaboration with Satpol PP conducted a curbing operation on street vendors. When the operation was carried out, many street vendors did not want to accept it, and even fought against the market management and Satpol PP. The resistance carried out by PKL to the market office and Satpol PP includes continuing to sell in places that have been prohibited and protesting against the market management and Satpol PP through PKL representatives visiting the market management office to convey their complaints and wishes.

Image 1. Street vendors’ stalls on Pasar Baru Ring Road
Image 2. The atmosphere of the demolition of kiosks and stalls on the Pasar Baru Ring Road

A. Internal Factors Causes of Rejection of the Relocation Policy for Street Vendors in the Central Market of Padang Panjang City

1. Business location that has been occupied for a long time

The time span of street vendors selling on Jalan Lingkar Pasar Baru is around 5 to 7 years. The beginning of street vendors selling on Jalan Lingkar Pasar Baru was because they first got a shelter market on Jalan Lingkar Pasar Baru, because during the fire and construction of the Padang Panjang City Center Market, the government provided a temporary shelter market for traders' selling locations and one of the shelter markets was on Jalan Lingkar Pasar.

2. Income Level

The income earned selling on Jalan Lingkar Pasar Baru is much more when compared to selling inside the Padang Panjang City Central Market, due to the lack of customers asking to shop inside the central market. This is influenced by the difficulty of access to reach the 2nd and 3rd floors which are only stairs and sometimes when it rains it gets slippery. The location or selling place they get inside the Padang Panjang Central Market is also considered not strategic and does not support the buying and selling process. PKL complain about the low number of sales in the place. This has an impact on the level of income they earn. The necessities of life that must still be met make street vendors look for locations or places that they feel will increase their income, one of which is on Jalan Lingkar Pasar Baru which is very strategically located on the side of the road, so that buyers can shop directly without the need to park their vehicles. This is what encourages street vendors to continue selling on Jalan Lingkar Pasar Baru.

3. Rental Price

The Padang Panjang City Government, represented by the Padang Panjang City Trade Office of Cooperatives, Small and Medium Enterprises, as the party that manages the Padang Panjang City Central Market, sets the rental price of kiosks or stalls in the central market based on the Padang Panjang Mayor's Decree. Each floor in each block has different stall and los rental prices, according to the cluster
with the highest stall price level ranging from IDR 90,000 per meter per month to the
lowest IDR 50,000 per meter per month. In addition, the highest level of los rent is
Rp. 40,000 per meter per month and the lowest level is Rp. 25,000 per meter per
month. Many of the traders complained about the stall or los rental prices that had
been set. They feel that the rental price is not in accordance with the income they
generate from selling inside the Padang Panjang City Center Market. Meanwhile,
when traders sell on the New Market ring road, they only pay Rp. 10,000 for the
person who helps lift the table and Rp. 2,000 for cleaning twice a week on
weekdays.

B. External Factors Causes of Rejection of the Relocation Policy for Street Vendors
in the Central Market of Padang Panjang City

1. The arrangement of trading places has not been well organized

    Merchants selling inside the central market are still messy and not in
accordance with the rules of the zoning system based on the type of commodity
being sold, (Ramadhan & Daniel, 2021). The merchandise sold by traders is still
mixed up. In contrast to the beginning where traders in the central market were
orderly. The thing that causes traders to disobey these rules is the economic
condition of traders in the central market which has decreased due to no buying
and selling. Meanwhile, traders are required to be able to survive, so traders take
various options that they can do. There are traders who still survive in the stalls or
loses they occupy now, but change to new types of merchandise. Traders who
are not able to stay in their current stalls or stalls choose to rent stalls or stalls
from other traders, which may be more affordable in terms of location or rental
price. As a result, in one block, the types of goods sold are different from the
provisions of the market management.

    Actions taken by the market manager in disciplining traders who sell not
according to the type of commodity set, namely giving a commodity warning letter,
as well as conducting socialization and direct arrest of violating traders. However,
the market manager is not consistent in disciplining traders who sell not according
to the zoning regulations for commodity types of merchandise. The market
manager's enthusiasm in disciplining traders only lasted for the first six months.
Furthermore, market managers rarely go down to observe directly into the central
market to see the condition of traders selling in the central market, as a result until
now violations of the rules of commodity types of merchandise are still ongoing
and the regulation of the zoning system of commodity types of merchandise has
not been implemented as targeted.

2. Law Enforcement Officials Are Inconsistent in Relocating Street Vendors

    The market management and Satpol PP were consistent in curbing
street vendors during the first year of the relocation policy. The market manager
Market management and Satpol PP continue to provide socialization and every
day check inside the central market, to see whether the PKL on Jalan Lingkar
Pasar Baru have moved into the central market or not, and the market
management and Satpol PP are also active in guarding the road and curbing PKL. For PKL who are still selling on Jalan Lingkar Pasar Baru, they are told to dismantle their stalls. Unlike the current situation, the curbing is carried out only at certain times. This condition is influenced by the family ties between the PKL and the market management and Satpol PP. PKL who sell on Jalan Lingkar Pasar Baru are generally the people of Padang Panjang City, this causes, the market manager and Satpol PP cannot act too hard because the family ties make the possibility of PKL on Jalan Lingkar Pasar Baru are neighbors or even relatives of the market manager and Satpol PP. The family ties that are owned give birth to sentiment in the market manager and Satpol PP towards PKL on Jalan Lingkar Pasar Baru, so they are afraid that when they are too forced to relocate PKL on Jalan Lingkar Pasar, it results in PKL experiencing economic difficulties.

CONCLUSION

Conclusions The rejection of the relocation policy of street vendors in the Padang Panjang City Central Market has led to conflicts between street vendors on the New Market Ring Road and the market manager, namely the Padang Panjang City Trade Office of Cooperatives, Small and Medium Enterprises. Street vendors on the New Market Ring Road reject the relocation policy to the Padang Panjang City Central Market due to two factors, namely internal factors and external factors. The internal factors that cause street vendors to reject the relocation policy are the location of the business that has been occupied for a long time, income level, and rental price. Meanwhile, external factors that cause street vendors to reject the relocation policy include the arrangement of trading places that are not well organized, and law enforcement officials are not consistent in relocating street vendors. The form of rejection of the relocation policy carried out by street vendors on Jalan Lingkar Pasar Baru against the market management, namely continuing to sell in a place that has been prohibited and refusing to be relocated. When the curbing was carried out, the street vendors temporarily moved to the Padang Panjang City Central Market and after feeling safe and there was no more curbing, the street vendors returned to their original place of selling. PKL also protested in the form of arguments and demonstrations to the market management. During the implementation of the relocation policy, there has never been a clash because the PKL have never fought using violence, while the market manager who is assisted by Satpol PP in disciplining PKL is also in a good way without using physical force, and still paying attention to family ties by using persuasive methods and conducting socialization to PKL.

REFERENCES
