

ANALYSIS ON THE PROBLEMS IN WRITING REFERENCES OF UNDERGRADUATE STUDENTS' RESEARCH PROPOSAL

Ryan Oktafiandi, Sofian Sofian, Yanti Sri Rezeki
English Study Program of Teacher Training and
Education Faculty Tanjungpura University Pontianak
Email: oktafiandiryan@student.untan.ac.id

Abstract

As a fundamental skill of academic writing, academic writers are supposed to be able to acknowledge all authors cited in their references. However, undergraduate students find it difficult. This research aimed at finding and describing problems in writing references done by undergraduate students. This research was carried out at Tanjungpura University, Pontianak, in the English Language Education Study Program, Teacher Training and Education Faculty. This research involved 16 undergraduate students academic year 2015. The objects of this research were the research proposals written by 16 undergraduate students. This was a descriptive qualitative study. Document analysis was used to gather the 161 references taken from the research proposals. Content analysis was the analysis instrument. The data denoted that problems arouse mainly from 5 major problems: 1). Improper way of writing in- text citation, 2). Improper way of writing reference list, 3). Not including page information in direct quotation, 4). Citation style inconsistency, 5). Indication of plagiarism. From these research findings, it can be concluded that commonly, the students of English Education of English Study Program, Teacher Training and Education Faculty, Tanjungpura University still have problems in writing citation and reference list.

Keywords: *Reference problems, Academic writing*

INTRODUCTION

In a system of higher education, a research proposal is required to be done as the first step before doing the actual research in the field. After writing research proposal, the last semester students of English Education are supposed to write an undergraduate thesis as a compulsory requirement to earn a bachelor degree. Therefore, for novice writers, research proposal writing is undoubtedly essential. In addition, another subskill in writing, citing source is a need in constructing the academic writing (Pecorari, 2008). They are expected to make analysis which shows the objectivity towards a problem found and followed by deep observation with a certain research methodology to be discussed. Besides, they need to construct sentences in various words to strengthen their arguments and cite properly.

Reference allows the academic writers to acknowledge the ideas or words of other authors. Knowing how to use sources properly is needed in avoiding plagiarism (Pecorari, 2008). Citation also demonstrates that the writers have read relevant background literature and can provide the authority for statements made. As novice academic researchers, they need to know more

about English academic writing. Block and Chi (as cited in Okamura, 2008) assert that to strengthen their academic writing, Non- English-speaking novice writers need to learn how to cite. In another way, they have to learn about paraphrasing and citation as well as part of English academic writing. As consequence, there must be a challenge for them in citation properly. Students in university, especially in Teacher Training Faculty of Tanjungpura University, should be able to deal with the challenge in comprehending and applying the citation to be able to compose an acceptable research proposal.

In Tanjungpura University, especially Teacher Training and Education Faculty, it actually has an Academic Writing Guideline book. All students get this in the first of matriculation class. This book has so many enlightenments for novice writers, starting from honor code, technical things about the academic writing and even about how to cite properly. Unfortunately, citation style is slightly different to what have been taught. Instead of APA or MLA, there is other way of citation called FKIP Style. This may cause confusion to English Education students. This book provides proper knowledge in citation, like paraphrasing, in-text citation, reference list.

On the preliminary research, however, by a glance review, the researcher still found improper use of citation done by 16 students of batch 2015. The researcher found several cases, such as could not find the integrated citation in reference list, found incomplete citation. In contrast, there are 2 students who researcher found has no inappropriate citation at all. Moreover, the researcher has done a brief interview to nineteen students of batch 2015 who have finished their seminar. Unfortunately, 3 students were not reachable due to their business. In total, there are 16 students who were agree to be the subject of this study. Next, the researcher asked what are their main problems in writing research proposals. Of 16 students, 14 students said citation, literature and theories are their main problems in conducting research proposals. 73% of them admitted that citation is difficult to deal with. It is not a common thing where students find citation a threat (Neville, 2010). Besides, after the researcher collected several research proposals and found out some cases. There were some students who still made mistakes in writing reference. One of the students did not cite two authors in the in-text citation while both authors were cited in reference list.

Several studies of students' academic writing have been done by some English Education of Tanjungpura University researchers concerning about citation use. A study done by Dewintha (2013), she reviewed all 7 literature reviews and found 6 students used the inconsistent citation. They used mix citation (FKIP, APA, MLA) in one proposal. In addition, as another way of citation, paraphrasing undoubtedly becomes an issue in academic writing for English Education student academic year 2013/2014. Moreover, an analysis study of citation writing is conducted to the ten English Education students in academic year 2015/2016 in Tanjungpura University (Rezeki, 2016). The researcher claimed that they had problems in writing citation, specifically in critical thinking and plagiarism indications. This study led to one conclusion that most of students lacked of skills and knowledge in citation. Besides the knowledge in citation, the study in citation style used by students has denoted another finding.

Another similar study which discusses the same problems with this research is Khairunnisa (2013) with her thesis entitled Students' Problems in Paraphrasing. This is a case study of the seventh semester students in ELT class of Teacher Training and Education Faculty of Tanjungpura University academic year 2013/2014. It was conducted with aims to find out the students' ability in paraphrasing and the problems faced in paraphrasing and the causes of the problems in paraphrasing. The research revealed that most of the students' paraphrasing was categorized unsatisfactory, even though there were some students who performed better paraphrases than others, they still unable to reach good or satisfactory stage. Besides, this study also discovered the difficulties faced by the students in paraphrasing. Surprisingly, the study of the students' paraphrase indicated that the majority of them committed errors in shifting the order of their concepts. In align to this study, most students whom researcher has interviewed with in the preliminary research, agreed to the extent of paraphrasing as an issue.

Another study on similar problem was done by Fartiessa (2013). Her thesis entitled Reference Style of Thesis Written by The Students of English Language Study Program. This research aims to describe the reference styles in English undergraduate research thesis and consistency in applying the chosen styles. This study was a descriptive study and conducted in English Language Education Study Program, Teacher Training and Education Faculty, Tanjungpura University, Pontianak. The theses prepared by graduates who finished their studies in 2012 were the subject of this investigation. The data showed that students used not only one reference style when writing their thesis. They frequently mixed APA and Indonesian reference style in one citation and made it turned into uncommon reference style. Compared to this study research findings, it revealed that inconsistency use of reference style encountered in the students' research proposals, especially in the in-text citation. They mostly mixed FKIP and APA style in their thesis.

However, problems in citation are not only done by undergraduate students, postgraduate students are not an exception. Several large areas of research have been examined pertinent to academic writing performed by post graduate or master degree students. For example, a study in citation of five hundred students in a university in Ghana was conducted by Lamptey and Atta-Obeng (2012). One of the findings was about inconsistencies in citation. Unlike FKIP Untan, faculty doesn't recommend any specified style or format. This worsens the postgraduate students who even get confused to decide which citation styles to use. Furthermore, Jalilifar and Dabbi (2013) has investigated on 65 master degree student theses, especially in introduction section. The results revealed that reporting/integral citation is used more than the other types of citation. By seeing this phenomenon, with the facts that most students experience the same in citation writing in their research proposals, the researcher intends to describe more and conduct a research about problems in writing references students' research proposals.

METHODOLOGY

As this study needs an in-depth analysis, descriptive qualitative was used because of the possibility to understand the in-depth contexts or settings

towards the issue (Creswell, 2007), in this case, citation. However, experts have different side of defining a qualitative study. Denzin and Lincoln (as cited in Creswell, 2007) bring it differently. They bring the definition of qualitative study by showing the impact of how qualitative research transforming the world. Transforming here is about becoming visible from invisible. They take the observer to be a collection of interpretative and material acts that enable the world to be seen. By that, the observer turns the world into a series of documents, including interviews, recordings, etc. By knowing this, qualitative research involves a natural setting and attempts to make sense of interpretation to this study.

This study has explored about the use of reference writing done by students in English Education Program of Tanjungpura University and analysed the findings. The researcher conducted this study by using descriptive qualitative because this approach presents a complex, detailed understanding of the issue (Creswell, 2007). In addition, in order to explore more about the student's citation, applying document content analysis is well suited to analyse text documents in a standardized way.

The researcher has no control over the data where the natural setting of data sources is happening. As what Lodico, Spaulding, and Voegtle (2006) identify, the natural setting is one of the characteristics in this study. Moreover, the hypotheses are formed after the data are collected and analysed (Lodico, Spaulding and Voegtle, 2006). It helps to reveal deeper by describing the case without making any assumption at first. Based on those descriptions and strengths, therefore, this study is best conducted using a descriptive qualitative approach.

Subject of Research

Another essential point in research is participant. This study was carried out at the 16 undergraduate students of English Education Study Program of Teacher Training and Education Faculty in Tanjungpura University Batch 2015. These participants have been chosen for three reasons. First, the researcher has made a good communication to some students from batch 2015. In other words, it is expected the researcher would get easy access to the other students. Second, all students from English Education Study Program had a research proposal writing class. They are supposed to get a well and proper exposure towards citation writing. Third, the chosen participants were taken from those who had finished their research proposal seminar. In the beginning, participants of the study were 19 students. However, 3 of them were unreachable.

Data Collection

The data was collected through documentary analysis. The documents used were research proposal of 16 undergraduate student batch 2015. There were 19 students who had done their research proposal seminar, 3 of them were unreachable. The researcher asked research proposals to every student to show their willingness to participate in this study. Finally, 16 research proposals were used as data resource. The citation was taken from literature review and bibliography of each research proposal. The literature review section is chosen based on the assumption that students demonstrate their critical writing. Besides, of all part of a research proposals, Literature Review has the most

discussions with experts' quotes, writers' ideas, citation and paraphrasing. In addition, expert theories are cited the most in Literature Review. Then, based on the data analysis later, the researcher made a table for all the findings. In order to help the discussion, Table 1 was used in this study. After the 16 research proposals analysed, the researcher classified each finding and put them to the student citation table. By this table, findings are easily described and analysed.

Data Analysis

Since this study focuses more on qualitative design, the researcher used content analysis. The researcher used qualitative content analysis to analyse data for the study. As a technique to research, content analysis has 6 components to analyse texts (Krippendorff, 2004), they are unitizing, sampling, recording/coding, reducing, inferring and narrating. Unitizing means the act of determining which texts the researcher used.

Research proposals of English Education Program in Tanjungpura University batch 2015 are the unit to analyze. In Sampling, in order to limit the observations, the researcher focused on students who have finished proposal seminar. 16 theses were taken and analyzed. All findings were grouped in Table 1 as seen in above. In order to indicate the presence of interesting or meaningful pieces of content, recording/coding is the next stage. Seeing that 16 proposals present hundreds of citations, reducing data is needed. When one finding shows the same case, the finding was reduced for efficient representations in Findings and Discussions.

However, in order to keep the authenticity and answer the research question, the researcher calculated all data in Table 1. After all, the next step is inferring. Inferring was done abductively. In other words, based on an observation or combination of observations, the researcher made a logical assumption, explanation, inference, conclusion, hypothesis, or best estimate. Narrating is the last phase to analyse the data in order to make comprehensible results to others. The discussion of answering the research question was done in this phase. This study is expected a result which reveals about the use of citation by students in their undergraduate theses.

FINDING AND DISCUSSION

Finding

This chapter is used to answer the research problem stated. The analysis and the interpretation of the data are acquired through the student research proposals. The data given in connection to the study topics is discussed in each finding.

As previously stated in introduction chapter, this study aims to explain the practices of citation writing by students in their research proposals. After collecting and analysing the data, the research compiled the findings into five groups. The group is based on the frequencies of problems appeared on students' whose proposals had been examined, especially the area of writing references. All of the analysis is based on APA (6th edition).

Improper way of writing in-text citation

- a. Not citing two authors

APA in-text citation style uses the author's last name and the year of

publication. Number of authors is supposed to be noticed in citation practices. Instead of one author, two, three or even six authors are sometimes found in a book, a journal article, etc. The researcher has found the practices of citing two authors. All of them have the same case, which is citing one author only as seen in following examples:

Sudarwati (2007, p. 204) state “the goal of hortatory texts is to provide a case for or against a specific stance or point of view and at the end of the argumentations, it makes a proposal.” (P1)

Nation (2009:14) also stated that vocabulary is one of the goals which should be reached by the teacher and learners in learning a language.(P2)

In the reference list:

Sudarwati And Eudia Grace. (2007). Look ahead: A Scientific and social studies curriculum, as well as an English course for senior high school students in year XI, Jakarta:Erlangga. (P1)

Nation, I. S. P & Newton, J. (2009). Teaching ESL/EFL listening and speaking. Routledge, Tylor & Francis. (P2)

b. Lack of publishing date

APA (6th ed) has given a guideline to cite for all kind of conditions. No date information is one of them. If there is no date, the use of abbreviation n.d. is recommended. The researcher has traced each link given in the reference list and could not find the publishing date. This practice can be found in these examples below:

Its purpose is to describe and reveal a particular person, place, or thing (Nurdiono, 2015). (P2)

Robertson (2010) said that if we have a large class, any number could be used to set the teams in hot seat game. (P4)

c. Unnecessary to use “et al”

et al. is commonly used in citing more than two or more authors. When a work has two authors, each time the work is referenced, both names are used. When a work has three, four, five or six authors, the use of the first author’s name plus et al (Pratuch, 2015). The findings show the students use et al. to one and two authors only. Here are the examples:

According Setiyadi et all (2007,p. 5) reading material is very important for teachers to take several times to reflect their reading material or student text asked to read. (P6)

In reference list, the author is only one. Moreover, the researcher has checked and found no more authors beside Bambang Setiyadi. In conclusion, it is unnecessary to put“et al.” for one author only.

Jacob et al (1981, p. 31) classify components of writing into content, organization, vocabulary, language use, and mechanic. (P15)

This citation has two authors in reference list. Following what Pratuch has recommended, it is unnecessary to use “et al.”.

Improper way of writing reference list

a. Misplacement of Location & Publisher

Location is the name of the city where the publisher is located. The location is listed on the title page. Location is usually cited for a book. The examples below show that the writer put location and publisher in order to cite journal article in reference list.

Rashidi, N. & Piran, M. (2011). The effect of extensive and intensive reading on Iranian EFL learners' vocabulary size and depth. *Journal of Language Teaching and Research*, 2, No. 2, pp. 471-482, March 2011. Finland. Academy Publisher. (P1)

Li, M. P. & Lam, B. H. (2013). Cooperative learning. The Hong Kong Institute of Education. Hong Kong. Retrieved at www.ied.edu.hk/aiclass/ (P2)

Another example shows that the writer uses the publisher as location. Publisher cannot be used as the location. The researcher has traced the citation and found that there is no city identified in the book. Based on APA (6th ed), when no city has been found in the book, use the city/state for the publisher's head office.

Nuttal, C. (1982). In order to teach reading skills in a foreign language, you must first learn the language (12th Ed). Heinemann: Educational Book Press. (P1)

Nation, I. S. P & Newton, J. (2009). Teaching ESL/EFL listening and speaking. Routledge, Tylor & Francis. (P2)

The position of location and publisher should be understood as a basic rule in writing reference list. However, based on the findings, the position of publisher and location are still inverted and misplaced. Here are the examples:

Brown, H. D. (2001). Second Edition of Teaching by Principles: An Interactive Approach to Language Pedagogy, second edition. Pearson Education: White Plains, N.Y (P2)

Richard, J. (2006). Communicative language today. Cambridge University, New York. (P2)

b. Issue number & volume

APA style requires both volume and issue numbers journal articles in reference list. In APA, volume number is listed first, then issue number in brackets. The writers have put all volume and issue numbers completely. However, they do not follow APA guideline.

Rashidi, N. & Piran, M. (2011). The effect of extensive and intensive reading on Iranian EFL learners' vocabulary size and depth. *The Journal of Language Teaching and Research*, Vol. 2, No. 2, is devoted to the study of language teaching and research, pp. 471-482, March 2011. Finland. Academy Publisher. (P1)

Ying, Y. S. (2000). Acquiring vocabulary through a context-based approach. *Forum*, 39/1: 18. (P5)

c. Book or journal title miswriting

There are two differences in writing title of books and journal titles. The title of books should be in italics. While in journal articles, the journal titles should be italicized. Following examples below show how the writers cite books and journal articles in reference list:

Thornburry, S. (2005). How to teach speaking skills. England: Pearson Educational Limited (P2)

Nunan, D. (1995). Research methods in language learning. Cambridge: University Press. (P2)

Douglas, F & Nancy, F. (2007). Checking for understanding. Virginia: The Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development (ASCD). (P2)

Wang, Zhaogang. (2015). An analysis on the use of video materials in college English teaching in China. *International Journal of English Language Teaching* Vol 2. (P3)

d. Unnecessary information to include

All information set by APA (6th ed) is complete and easy to trace. Other information does not need to be included. Name of street is one of the examples. Trumpington Street is a street in Cambridge. APA does not require this information.

Luoma, S. (2004). *Assessing speaking*. Trumpington Street: Cambridge: University Press. (P2)

Beside the name of street, writing the publisher is supposed to be only the name of the publisher. Put Australia Pty Ltd in reference list is considered as unnecessary to include.

Anderson, K. & M. (1997). *Text Types in English*. Australira: Macmilan Education Australia Pty Ltd. (P2)

In the fifth and earlier editions, the APA Publication Manual specified the use of et al. to shorten lengthy author lists in the references as well as in text citations (Pratuch, 2015). However, this rule has been changed in the sixth edition. Seeing this change, the use of et al. is unnecessary.

Kimmelman et al. (1989). *Reading and study skill: A rhetorical approach*. New York:McMillan. (P5)

e. Mistakes on citing other sources

The students made their references without determining the resources from the books, journals, magazine, articles, newspaper, document, thesis, and internet. Apparently, beside books, there are many kinds of sources that have been featured in APA (6th ed). However, the findings show the students have problems in citing sources excluding books. Citing a web page is one of them. The researcher has traced the link and the webpage does not provide the article with dates. A webpage with author but no date is supposed to be written as “(n.d)”

Nurdiono. (2015). Purpose and Example Descriptive Text. Retrieved from <http://www.nurdiono.com/purpose-and-example-descriptive-text.html> (P2)

Citing an e-journal article from a webpage with no DOI has the same way to cite common journal articles. Instead of article title, journal title should be italicized.

Li, M. P. & Lam, B. H. (2013). *Cooperative learning*. The Hong Kong Institute of Education. Hong Kong. Retrived at www.ied.edu.hk/aclass/ (P2)

Analyzing this refence list, the researcher concludes this is a thesis. Citing a journal from university needs a special attention. The title of this thesis is supposed to be in italic. In addition, the writer should put the location plus university in brackets. This information shouldnot be in italic.

Wastawan, K. (2014). *Students' reading comprehension is improved through cooperative learning in the form of make a match activity*. Bandar Lampung: University of Lampung, 11. (P10)

This is a course handout from a Chinese language teacher training day. In reference list, citing a course handout is supposed to be:

Wilson, D. (2013). Vocabulary hot-seat [Handout]. United Kingdom: Discover China: Chinese language teacher training day.

Wilson, D. (2013). Vocabulary hot-seat. United Kingdom: Discover China. (P4)

These following examples below are all citing theses. Citing a thesis needs the information of university and city at the end of citation. They are all in brackets.

Skopal, L. (2015). Duolingo in the Teaching Process (P14)

Elyani, V. D. (2018). Using an inductive method, students can improve their mastery of the Simple Past Tense. Pontianak: Tanjungpura University. (P14)

Muddin, A. (2018). The Use of Duolingo to Improve Students' Vocabulary. (P14)

f. Missing two authors

Two authors appeared in the in-text citation. However, only one author is in the reference list. These are the following examples found in reference list:

Kimmelman et al. (1989). Reading and study skill: A rhetorical approach. New York: McMillan. (P5)

L. Gentilucci, R. G. (2007). Think-aloud strategy: Metacognitive development and measuring comprehension in the middle school second-language classroom using the think-aloud approach. International Reading Association. (P10)

Nezarat, T. M. (2012). Mobile-Assisted Language Learning. International Journal of Distributed and Parallel Systems (IJDPS), 309-319. (P14)

Hagiwara, A. L. (1990). Intensive English for Communication, Book 1. Jakarta: Binarupa Aksara. (P14)

Following in-text citation below show the presence of two authors which are not included in above reference list.

Based on Krantz and Kimmelman (1989) it is hard for students to estimate the meaning of unfamiliar words if they are inexperienced with the parts of speech or have no prior experiences determining if the unknown word is a noun, adverb, verb and adjective. (P5)

“Think Aloud is one of the “transactional methods” since it is a cooperative process of teachers and students working together to construct understandings of text as they engage with it”, according to Pressley (as stated in McKeown and Gentilucci, 2007, p.137). (P10)

Miangah and Nezarat (2012) reckon that “Mobile devices do not alternatively use as learning devices apart from serve as an extension to learn in emerging environment having new capabilities, despite not all learning content and activities are appropriate for mobile devices”. (P14)

Lindell and Hagiwara (1990, p.105) have categorized four forms of regular verbs; affirmative statements, question, negation, and short answer. (P14)

Not including page information in direct quotation

In APA style, the presence of page numbers in paraphrasing is not required. However, students are encouraged to also provide the page number for a paraphrased citation when it would help the reader locate the relevant information in a long or complex text (Lee, 2015). Based on the finding, most students put page number in paraphrasing.

However, direct quotation brings an issue. In APA, unlike paraphrasing, direct quotation needs page numbers in the in-text citation. A direct quotation includes the words of another writer arguments and is displayed in quotation marks if the quotation is fewer than 40 words. The examples below show the absence of pagenumbers in the student research proposals:

According to Gilakjani (2016) mentions “Pronunciation is learnt by repeating sounds and correcting them when produced inaccurately. When learners begin to learn how to pronounce words correctly, they develop new habits and overcome challenges caused by their first language.” (P3)

According to B.O. Smith (1969): “Teaching is a system of actions intended to produce learning.” (P13)

Citation style inconsistency

Each citation style is used in different fields. Students in Education Faculty are supposed to use APA reference style. However, an association might provide its own reference style. Teacher Training and Education Faculty of Tanjungpura University (FKIP Untan) includes a citation standard for students. In the first semester, all students were given a handbook entitled *Pedoman Penulisan Karya Ilmiah* (2013). This book teaches students how to construct a thesis, including how to cite sources and create a bibliography. This style is called FKIP Untan reference style. In academic writing, consistency of using certain style of reference is a must. Consistency in using one reference style in academic writing is an important aspect (Lipson, 2006). However, some students were not being consistent in using reference styles, especially in the in-text citation. They mostly mixed FKIP and APA style within a paper. The following examples are FKIP reference style:

According to Carter and Nunan (2001:18), grammar is the whole system and structure of language in general. (P2)

Fraenkel (1984:96) indicate that learning how to enunciate a language involves two fundamental phases. (P3)

Discussion

It is obvious that referencing is an essential part in scientific writing and that students should be used in their work. It is strongly informed that reference avoids plagiarism and supports the students’ arguments. For instance, when students wrote scientific writing, they should quote and cite other related sources or findings to make their writing trustworthy. In other word, it was not just collection of ideas but something scientific. It was still not complete if students did their research proposals without stating their sources in reference. In fact, the results indicate that, based on findings, the students still made some mistakes on their citations for both in-text citation and reference list indication of plagiarism. Since the researcher does not analyse or interview the students to explore more about their intention and knowledge in citation, this finding cannot be called as plagiarism incidents. The researcher has checked every single in-text citation and cannot find the same authors in the reference list (e.g., P2, P3, P4, P6, P7, P9, P11, P12). In

other words, the students did not write down some of the resources in references. They may have overlooked some of them, despite the fact that it is an absolute essential. Apparently, citation with no acknowledgement of the authors in the reference list may lead to plagiarism. As academic writers,

students must document all of the sources of information in their thesis. The reason is to credit the authors and publishers for their original work and to enable the readers to consult the same sources. Through the proper use of sources and citations, students openly acknowledge where their ideas come from. Even if they use their own words but if they find the ideas in a publication of any kind, they must document the source. The researcher groups the findings into 5 categories as written above. The analysis had been done on 16 research proposals. In total, there are 161 problematic findings of both reference list and in-text citation. However, most of them are found in the in-text citation.

The purpose of this study is to find problems in writing references of students' research proposal. 16 research proposals have been analyzed and there were 161 problematic reference for both in-text citation and reference list found in this study. To answer the research question, there are 5 types of problems mostly done by student batch 2015 in their research proposals. The research discussion was classified into 5 problems as follows:

1. Improper way of writing in-text citation

In-text citation is easily found on any research. In batch 2015, most of their proposals were found several problems. First, when students cited any sources with two authors, they did not cite them in the in-text citation. Though, the reference list mentioned two authors. Second is lack of publishing date. Researcher has traced the source and could not find the publishing date. However, students keep inserting the year while there is an option to put "n.d.". The last is the unnecessary to use "et al". Students use "et al" to one and two authors sources. "Et al" is used when a work has 3, 4, 5 or six authors (Pratuch, 2015).

2. Improper way of writing reference list

Beside in-text citation, other problems come from reference list. First is the misplacement of location & publisher. One of the cases is, students put location and publisher in order to cite journal article. Location is usually cited for a book. Next is issue number & volume. Volume and issue number are easily found on the research proposals. However, students do not follow the APA guideline in writing the volume and issue number. Third is books or journal title miswriting. Students still make several mistakes in citing the title in reference list. Some of them did not italicize the journal or book titles. Unimportant information to include is the fourth finding. There is unnecessary to include name of street. APA does not require this information. Fifth is the mistakes on citing other sources. Citing a web, e-journal a page is one of them. The finding shows students have problems in citing sources excluding books. The sixth is two authors missing. The two authors citation appeared in the in-text citation which were not included in the reference list.

3. Not including page information in direct quotation

In paraphrase, it is just an encouragement to put page number (Lee, 2015). However, in APA guideline, page information is needed in direct quotation in order to help the reader to trace the related information. Based on the findings, it demonstrates the absence of page numbers in the in-text citation.

4. Citation style inconsistency

Inconsistency of citation style is found in this study. Since consistency in

using one reference style is seen as an essential part (Lipson, 2006), this study confirms that students were not being consistent in using citation style. Most of them mixed both FKIP and APA style in their proposals. As students of English Education Study Program, the use of APA citation style is considered as the main guideline to cite both in-text and reference list.

5. Indication of plagiarism

It is found that several theories are not found in reference list. Acknowledging all sources is an essential part in academic writing. When students present the citation with no acknowledgment in the reference list, it may be accused to plagiarism (Zhang, 2016). Of 16 students, 14 students said citation, literature and theories are their main problems. Most students see references as a threat. (Neville, 2016). Difficulties faced by students in citation related to their performance in citing (Khairunnisa, 2013).

The data confirms that students of English Education batch 2015 have made some problems on writing references. However, as seen in table 1 above, of 16 students, there was only 1 student (participant number 16) who cited well. The researcher could not find any inappropriate references. In align, the finding of Dewintha (2013) in her study on analysing citation style showed the same. Of 7 participants, found only 1 participant that consistently use the citation. This might lead to one conclusion. Compared to the most students, the knowledgeable students in term of writing references is still minority. The generalizability of the results is limited by the amount of research proposals were used as subject of research. Future studies should take into account to the larger amount of data in order to get more varied descriptions.

CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTION

Conclusion

To conclude the question based on the research findings the beginning of this study, it is now possible to state that the students have done several problems in writing references. Based on the analysis, findings are grouped into 5 major types. They are improper way of writing in-text citation, improper way of writing reference list, not including page information in direct quotes, citation style inconsistency and indication of plagiarism.

From these research findings, the researcher can conclude that commonly, the students of English Education of English Study Program, Teacher Training and Education Faculty, Tanjungpura University still have problems in writing citation and reference list. It was obvious that the students often did not write down some of the resources in reference lists. They wrote about some related findings in their research proposals but they did not write it on the references. The students made their references without determining the resources from the books, journals, magazine, articles, newspaper, document, thesis, and internet. The majority of them just used the book as a source of information.

Suggestion

In this part, the researcher would like to contribute some suggestions for students, institutions and further researchers. First, students must improve their knowledge in particular citation style. Second, for institution, in this case, English Study Program of Teacher Training and Education Faculty of

Tanjungpura University, plagiarism and citation practices need to be well delivered to all students. Making citation policy or updating the Academic Writing Guideline book with the latest version of citation style might be one of solutions. Third, to the further researchers, particularly those who have the same problem and interested in conducting research, it is suggested that to explore more in a big scope of students. Moreover, this study can be a reference. Hopefully, there will be any further research of how to complete this study.

REFERENCES

- Bailey, S. (2003). *Academic writing: A handbook for international students* (2nd ed.). England: Routledge.
- Creswell, W. J. (2007). *Qualitative inquiry and research design choosing among five approaches* (2nd ed.). London: Sage Publications.
- Dewintha, R. (2013). Citation style in undergraduate thesis literature review. *Jurnal Pendidikan dan Pembelajaran*, 4(6), 1-10.
- Dogruer, N., Eyyam, R., Menevis, I. (2011). The use of the internet for educational purposes. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*. 28(2011). 606-611. doi: 10.1016/j.sbspro.2011.11.115
- Fartiessa, E., A. (2013). Reference style of thesis written by the students of English language education study program. *Jurnal Pendidikan dan Pembelajaran*, 3(2), 1-12.
- Fulwiler, T. (2002). *College writing: A personal approach to academic writing* (3rd ed.). Portsmouth: Boynton/Cook.
- Gustavii, B. (2008). *How to write and illustrate a scientific paper* (2nd ed.). New York: Cambridge University Press
- Harvey, G (1995). *Writing with sources: A guide for Harvard students*. Cambridge: Harvard University.
- Jalilifar, A. & Dabbi, R. (2013). Citation in applied linguistics: Analysis of introduction sections of Iranian master's theses. *Linguistik Online*, 7(12), 91-104.
- Jordan, R., R. (2003). *Academic writing course: Study skills in English* (3rd ed.). England: Pearson.
- Kargbo, A. J. (2014). Undergraduate students' problems with citing references. *The Reference Librarian*, 51(3) 222-236, doi: 10.1080/02763871003769673
- Khairunnisa, W. (2013). Students problems in paraphrasing. *Jurnal*

Pendidikan dan Pembelajaran,, 3(11), 1-10.

Krippendorff, K. (2004). *Content analysis: An introduction to its methodology* (2nd ed.). London: Sage Publications.

Lamprey, B., R., & Obeng, A., H. (2012). Challenges with reference citations among postgraduate students at the Kwame Nkrumah University of Science and Technology, Kumasi, Ghana. *Journal of Science and Technology*, 32(4), 69-80.

Lee, C. (2015, March 3). When and how to include page numbers in APA style citations [Blog Post]. Retrieved from <https://blog.apastyle.org/apastyle/2015/03/when-and-how-to-include-page-numbers-in-apa-style-citations.html>

Lipson, C. (2006). *Cite right*. London: University of Chicago Press.

Lodico, M. G., Spaulding, D. T., & Voegtle, K. H. (2006). *Methods in educational research: from theory to practice*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Neville C. (2010). *The complete guide to referencing and avoiding plagiarism* (2nd ed.). England: USA University Press

Okamura, A. (2008). Citation forms in scientific texts: Similarities and differences in L1 and L2 professional writing. *Nordic Journal of English Studies*, 7(3), 61-81.

Oshima, A. & Hogue, A. (2007). *Introduction to academic writing* (3rd ed.). New York: Pearson.

Pratuch, H. J. (2015). VI. Using APA style in academic writing: et al. Retrieved from <https://academiccoachingandwriting.org/academic-writing/academic-writing-blog/vi-using-apa-style-in-academic-writing-et-al>

Pecorari, D. (2008). *Academic writing and plagiarism: A linguistic analysis*. London: Continuum International Publishing Group

Rezeki, Y. S. (2016). Analysis of EFL students' citation practices and problems in academic writing. *International Journal of Educational Best Practices (IJEBC)*, 2(1), 62-72.

Smith, S. W. (2008). *Plagiarism, the internet and student learning*. New York: Routledge.

Szabo, A., & Underwood, J. (2004). Cybercheats: Is information and communication technology fuelling academic dishonesty?. *Active learning*

inHigher Education, 5(180), 181-199. doi: 10.1177/1469787404043815

Teacher Training and Education Faculty of Tanjungpura University. (2013).
Pedoman penulisan karya ilmiah FKIP Universitas Tanjungpura.
Pontianak: Teacher Training and Education Faculty.

Walker, R. J., & Taylor, T. (2006). The Columbia guide to online style (2nd
ed.).New York: Columbia University Press.

Xia, W. & Luxin, Y (2012) Problems and strategies in learning to write a
thesis proposal: A study of six M.A. students in TEFL program. Chinese
Journal of Applied Linguistics, 35(3), 324-341.

Zhang, Y. (2016) Against plagiarism.Hangzhou: Zhejiang University
Press.